

# HISTORIC PRESERVATION THEORY

*An Anthology*

*Readings from the 18th to the 21st Century*

EDITED BY

JORGE OTERO-PAILOS



DESIGN BOOKS

## *For Paloma and Paul*

---

Copyright ©2023 by Jorge Otero-Pailos

All rights reserved

Printed in the United States of America

First edition, 2023

ISBN 978-0-578-54714-5 (paperback)

ISBN 979-8-218-00430-9 (ebook)

Library of Congress Control Number 2022938729

Designed and typeset by Jonathan D. Lippincott

Cover image: Jorge Otero-Pailos, *Distributed Monument 6* (2014). Dust transferred from Norwegian Ministry of Petroleum and Energy onto a latex cast. 39 x 24 x 3 inches.  
(Courtesy Otero-Pailos Studio.)

Published by Design Books

Sharon, CT

Distributed by

National Book Network

15200 NBN Way

Blue Ridge Summit, PA 17214

(717) 794-3800

Customercare@nbnbooks.com

This publication is made possible in part by grants from the Graham Foundation for Advanced Studies in the Visual Arts, the James Marston Fitch Charitable Foundation, and the Graduate School of Architecture, Planning and Preservation, Columbia University.

---

For additional teaching and learning resources related to historic preservation theory, please visit [www.historicpreservationtheory.net](http://www.historicpreservationtheory.net) or scan the QR code on page 583.

# CONTENTS

*Introduction* • ix

**Johann Joachim Winckelmann**, Thoughts on the Imitation of the Painting and Sculpture of the Greeks, 1755 • 1

**Emmerich de Vattel**, The Law of War with Respect to the Property of the Enemy, 1758 • 6

**Jacques-François Blondel**, An Analysis of the Art, or How to Distinguish Good Architecture from Mediocre Architecture, 1771 • 10

**Abbé Henri Grégoire**, Report on the Destructions Brought About by Vandalism, and on the Means to Suppress It, 1793 • 14

**Étienne-Louis Boullée**, Character, 1797 • 21

**Karl Friedrich Schinkel**, Concerning the Preservation of the Monuments and Antiquities of Our Country, 1815 • 25

**Victor Hugo**, War on the Demolishers! 1825, 1832 • 30

**Antoine-Chrysostome Quatremère de Quincy**, Imitation, Restitution and Restoration, 1832 • 35

**Carlo Fea**, Legal Briefs Concerning Antiquities and Public Establishments, 1833 • 40

**Leo von Klenze**, Address at the Inauguration of Restoration Work on the Acropolis and Memorandum on the Acropolis, 1834 • 45

**John Ruskin**, The Lamp of Memory, 1849 • 50

**Ann Pamela Cunningham**, To the Ladies of the South, 1853 • 56

**Eugène-Emmanuel Viollet-le-Duc**, Restoration, 1854 • 60

**John Rollin Ridge**, Mount Shasta, 1854, • 66

**Wilhelm Lübke**, The Restoration Fever, 1861 • 69

- George Gilbert Scott**, *On the Conservation of Ancient Architectural Monuments and Remains*, 1862 • 74
- Francis Lieber**, *Instructions for the Government of Armies of the United States in the Field*, 1863 • 80
- Frederick Law Olmsted**, *The Yosemite Valley and the Mariposa Big Trees: A Preliminary Report*, 1865 • 85
- William Morris**, *Manifesto of the Society for the Protection of Ancient Buildings*, 1877 • 91
- Alfonso Rubbiani**, *The Houses of the Bourgeoisie*, 1879 • 94
- Camillo Sitte**, *City Planning According to Artistic Principles*, 1889 • 100
- Camillo Boito**, *Restoration in Architecture: First Dialogue*, 1893 • 106
- John Muir**, *The National Parks and Forest Reservations*, 1895 • 112
- Alois Riegl**, *The Modern Cult of Monuments: Its Character and Its Origin*, 1903 • 117
- Marcel Proust**, *Death Comes to the Cathedrals*, 1904 • 123
- Georg Gottfried Dehio**, *Monument Protection and Monument Preservation in the Nineteenth Century*, 1905 • 128
- Sigurd Curman**, *Principles of Restoration*, 1906 • 134
- Max Dvořák**, *The Preservation Catechism*, 1916 • 140
- Van Wyck Brooks**, *On Creating a Usable Past*, 1918 • 145
- Paul Clemen**, *Protection of Art During War*, 1919 • 149
- Leopoldo Torres Balbás**, *The Use of Ancient Monuments*, 1920 • 155
- Countee Cullen**, *Heritage*, 1925 • 159
- Sigmund Freud**, *Civilization and Its Discontents*, 1929 • 162
- Gustavo Giovannoni**, *The Improvement of Inner Cores: The Theory of Pruning*, 1931 • 169
- Walter Benjamin**, *The Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction*, 1935 • 175
- Martin Heidegger**, *The Word of Nietzsche: "God is Dead,"* 1936 • 182
- Lucio Costa**, *Necessary Documentation*, 1937 • 188
- Lewis Mumford**, *The Death of the Monument*, 1937 • 195
- Liang Sicheng**, *Why We Must Research Chinese Traditional Architecture*, 1944 • 201
- Roberto Pane**, *The Restoration of Monuments*, 1944 • 206
- Ambrogio Annoni**, *Considerations for the Building Rebirth of Milan*, 1945 • 211
- Max Horkheimer and Theodor W. Adorno**, *The Culture Industry: Enlightenment as Mass Deception*, 1947 • 216
- Harry Fett**, *Continuity*, 1949 • 221
- Claude Lévi-Strauss**, *Race and History*, 1952 • 226
- Fernando Chueca Goitia and Others**, *The Alhambra Manifesto*, 1953 • 232

- Ernesto Nathan Rogers**, Continuity or Crisis, 1957 • 238
- John Summerson**, The Case for a Theory of 'Modern' Architecture, 1957 • 244
- Hannah Arendt**, The Durability of the World, 1958 • 250
- Fernand Braudel**, History and the Social Sciences: *The Longue Durée*, 1958 • 254
- Hans-Georg Gadamer**, Reconstruction and Integration as Hermeneutic Tasks, 1960 • 261
- André Malraux**, T.V.A. of Archaeology, 1960 • 267
- Jane Jacobs**, The Need for Aged Buildings, 1961 • 272
- Cesare Brandi**, Postscript to the Treatment of Lacunae, 1961 • 279
- José Villagrán García**, Architecture and Monument Restoration, 1966 • 285
- Donald W. Winnicott**, The Location of Cultural Experience, 1967 • 293
- Aldo Rossi**, What To Do with Old Cities, 1968 • 298
- Mierle Laderman Ukeles**, Manifesto for Maintenance Art, 1969! • 303
- Michel Foucault**, Nietzsche, Genealogy, History, 1971 • 308
- Kevin Lynch**, What Time Is This Place?, 1972 • 314
- Giulio Carlo Argan**, A Policy for the Preservation of Historic Centers, 1973 • 322
- Henri Lefebvre**, Monumental Space, 1974 • 330
- August Gebeßler**, Old Towns and Historic Preservation, 1975 • 337
- Burton J. Bledstein**, The Culture of Professionalism, 1976 • 342
- Giovanni Carbonara**, The Reintegration of the Image, 1976 • 350
- Dean Maccannell**, The Tourist, 1976 • 359
- Evgenii Vasil'evich Mikhailovskii**, The Methods of Restoration of Architectural Monuments: Contemporary Theoretical Conceptions, 1977 • 366
- Jacques Derrida**, The Parergon, 1978 • 375
- James Marston Fitch**, Architecture and Energy, 1978 • 381
- John Brinckerhoff Jackson**, How to Study the Landscape, 1980 • 387
- Cedric Price**, The Case Against Conservation, 1981 • 393
- Eric J. Hobsbawm**, Inventing Traditions, 1983 • 398
- Pierre Nora**, Between Memory and History: *Les Lieux de Mémoire*, 1984 • 404
- Jordan E. Dimacopoulos**, Anastylis and Anasteloseis, 1985 • 412
- Robert Hewison**, The Heritage Industry, 1987 • 419
- Fredric Jameson**, Nostalgia for the Present, 1989 • 426
- Ján Bakoš**, Monuments and Ideologies, 1991 • 432
- Gilles Deleuze and Félix Guattari**, Percept, Affect, and Concept, 1991 • 439
- Vittorio Gregotti**, On Modification, 1991 • 446

<b>James E. Young</b> , The Counter-Monument, 1992	•	452
<b>Edward Said</b> , Professionals and Amateurs, 1993	•	460
<b>Stephen E. Snow</b> , The Emergence of a New Genre of Cultural Performance, 1993	•	466
<b>Raphael Samuel</b> , Heritage-Baiting, 1994	•	473
<b>Françoise Choay</b> , Seven Proposals on the Concept of Authenticity and Its Use in Historical Heritage Practices, 1994	•	477
<b>Dolores Hayden</b> , Public Art and Public Memory, 1995	•	486
<b>Michel-Rolph Trouillot</b> , Silencing the Past, 1995	•	493
<b>David Lowenthal</b> , Fabricating Heritage, 1998	•	499
<b>Dipesh Chakrabarty</b> , What Is Invested in Anachronism?, 2000	•	506
<b>Catherine M. Howett</b> , Integrity as a Value in Cultural Landscape Preservation, 2000	•	513
<b>Nezar Alsayyad</b> , Constructing The “Other”: Toward a Typology, 2001	•	523
<b>Daniel M. Abramson</b> , Obsolescence: Notes Towards a History, 2003	•	530
<b>Rem Koolhaas</b> , Preservation Is Overtaking Us, 2004	•	538
<b>Salvador Muñoz-Viñas</b> , Contemporary Theory of Conservation, 2005	•	543
<b>Andrew Herscher</b> , Counter-Heritage and Violence, 2006	•	549
<b>Laurajane Smith</b> , Heritage as a Cultural Process, 2006	•	557
<b>Bruno Latour and Alben Yaneva</b> , Give Me a Gun and I Will Make All Buildings Move: An ANT’s View of Architecture, 2008	•	566
<b>Giorgio Agamben</b> , Philosophical Archeology, 2008	•	572
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	•	577
<i>Translators</i>	•	579
<i>Index of Authors</i>	•	581
<i>QR Code</i>	•	583
<i>About the Author</i>	•	585