

# Reimagining Chinatown 重繪:曼哈頓華埠

May 3, 2017

Instructors: Ethel Sheffer & Douglas Woodward

Teaching Assistant: Dorothy MacAusland

Angel Lopez Zamora | Emily Fesette | Eri Furusawa | Jiaohong Du

Joan Zhang | Madeline Berry | Shaochun Zhou | Xin Guo | Yi Jiang



- I. Introduction
- II. Research
- III. Initiatives
- IV. Closing



3

京市



#### Our Clients

#### Gale Brewer

Manhattan Borough President



Margaret Chin City Council Member, District 1 Vision Statement Promote, preserve, and protect the historic singularity and cultural uniqueness of Manhattan Chinatown by

preventing displacement

100H.3

- supporting the area's economic vitality
- safeguarding neighborhood character

### Research

### 調查研究

# Previous Studies & Their Limitations



1976



### **Boundary Disputes**

Asian American Federation Study Area 2008 Department of City Planning Neighborhood 2010 Tabulation Area

Chinatown and Little Italy Historic District

2010

Chinatown Working Group CAPZ Linguistic 2011 Landscape

Chinatown BID Boundary 2011

Chinatown Working Group Rezoning Plan 2013

Google Maps 2017

0.5 Mile:

Source: Pratt Center for Community Development, The Collective for Community, Culture and the Environment, Chinatown Working Group, Chinatown Partnership, Chinatown BID, National Park Service, Asian American Federation, NYC Department of City Planning, Google Maps.

#### Top 10 Cities with the Highest Percentage of Populations of Chinese Americans Seattle Boston New York City 549,181 Sacramento San Francisco 0akland San Jose Irvine San Franciso 21.4% Irvine 13.3% Honolulu 0akland 8.3% San Jose 7.2% Plano New York City 6.5% Plano 5.5% Honolulu 5.4% Seattle 4.7% Boston 4.5% Sacramento 4.4% Source: 2011-2015 ACS

#### Chinese Americans in Major New York City Chinatowns









German Band, Lower East Side, 1876



Little Italy, Mulberry Street, c. 1900



Chinatown Historic Core, c. 1900



#### Chinese 49ers During the California Gold Rush

Source: Then & Now: Chinatowns of New York City, Wendy Wan-Yin Tan



Canal and Baxter Streets, 1910



#### Pell and Mott Streets, 1930s

Source: Then & Now: Chinatowns of New York City, Wendy Wan-Yin Tan



Park Row, 2015



EIS Study Area, 2007

Source: http://animalnewyork.com/2015/heres-what-its-like-to-live-behind-an-nypd-checkpoint-in-chinatown/



Daniel Ostrow, Manhattan's Chinatown, Arcadia Publishing: 2008.



# Affordability & Housing

- Affordable housing units are not truly affordable
  - Local AMI (\$37,362) less than Citywide AMI (\$85,900)
     published by HUD (2013)
  - Limited supply for low-income and extremely low-income groups
- Financial stress

 $\bigcirc$ 

- Rental price increased more rapidly than household income
- Rent burden
- Overcrowding is common



#### **Economic Development**

- Local Economic Conditions
  - Dominated by small businesses
  - Strong service sector
  - Retail trade has greatly declined, health care has greatly increased
  - Average unemployment rate is greater in Chinatown than Manhattan's overall by 2.4%, median annual income is lower than Manhattan's average by \$20,000
- Economic Challenges
  - Business Owners
    - Customer loss
    - Increased commercial rents

- Local Workers & Residents
  - Limited English proficiency
  - High unemployment

## Street Vending

Contro Street

Extersited



Map of Street Vending Conditions on Canal Street (from Broadway to Bowery)

Canal Street

VICILISING

Bower

Source: DO

#### Sanitation

- Existing Sanitary Conditions
  - Commercial Trash Piles
  - Scattered Debris
  - Stagnant Water
  - Rat Infestation



#### Rat Infestation



| 25   |         |      |
|------|---------|------|
|      |         |      |
|      |         |      |
| Rate | sightin | igs  |
| Low  | /       | High |



Vision Statement Promote, preserve, and protect the historic singularity and cultural uniqueness of Manhattan Chinatown by
preventing displacement
supporting the area's economic vitality
safeguarding neighborhood character

100H.3

### Initiatives

改進建議



#### Initiatives

#### **Enhancing Wayfinding**

Preserving Community Identity

**Promoting Efficient Circulation** 

Improving Living & Street Conditions

**Securing Housing Tenure** 

IUUHJ

**Empowering the Local Economy** 







#### Tour Brochure & Kiosk Map



#### <u>Why</u>

- Foster pride
- Educate residents and visitors
- Enhance visitor experience
- Increase visibility of Chinatown's
   unique assets

- Large scale map printed on blank side of the kiosk at Canal & Baxter Streets
- Printed copies available at kiosk
- Online version available for download





# **WELCOME TO** CHINATOWN 曼哈頓華埠歡迎您

#### BEFORE

Lower Manhattan was dominated by a lake called Collect Pond (also known as Fresh Water Pond).

#### The lake was filled in.

1847

1855

This area on top of this became Five Points, the notorious slum and famous subject of both Charles Dickens and Jacob Riis.

"reeking everywhere of dirt and filth." ----- Charles Dickens

In the early to mid 19th century, the area was home to populations of Irish, German, Jewish, Italian, and Puerto Rican.

Manhattan Chinatown's story begins at the dawn of the 19th century when the first merchants began to arrive from China.

POTLIGHTS

Bowery Savings Bank 包屋街儲備銀行 **Q** 130 Bowery Designed by Stanford White in the Roman Revival style, this early savings bank is an LPC Landmark.

1813

#### Mahavana Temple

16 feet.

大乘寺 3 133 Canal Street The largest Buddhist temple in New York City, it also boasts the tallest Buddha statue in the city at

Five Points & Canal Street 820Originally occupied by Collect Pond, this area was filled in by 1813. By 1825, what had been the pond became an infamous slum: Five Points.

穆尼閣

New York.

Church of the Transfiguration 華埠顯聖容天主堂 🔇 29 Mott Street Designated an LPC Landmark in 1966, this 19th century church is one of the few Georgian-Gothic

#### Kimlau Square 華裔軍人忠烈坊

Now home to the Kimlau Chinese population startes to boom after the California Memorial Arch and statue of Lin Gold Rush and the construction of the transcontinental Ze-Xu, this area is the former location of the connection point between the elevated Third and Second Avenues railroad lines from 1878-1955.

> Over the last several centuries, the area we now know of as Chinatown has been home to numerous different ethnic enclaves: These include Irish, German, Jewish, Italian, Puerto Rican, and obviously Chinese. The physical character of the neighborhood has also changed drastically over the past few centuries.



The oldest brick row house in

20 WOL

O 18 Bowery

Years after the first Chinese immigrants began to settle in Lower Manhattan, Chinatown is still a thriving and growing community. The neighborhood is easily distinguished by its multi-layered signage in various Chinese dialects, street vendors, and oriental motifs on doors, lights, and architectural features.

Since no major planning interventions have been successfully completed during Chinatown's tenure, the neighborhood has grown and changed organically. Recent years have seen increased interest in creating a master plan or special purpose district for the neighborhood.



Created as part of "REIMAGINING CHINATOWN" A Columbia University GSAPP Urban Planning Studio Instructors: Ethel Sheffer & Douglas Woodward

Manhattan Borough President Gale Brewer Councilmember Margaret Chin, District 1



Designed by Yi Jiang Edited by Madeline Berry & Joan Zhang

churches remaining in New York.

can seat 2,300 and was designated an LPC Landmark in 2010. Dovers Street

Pell Street & Bowery D Park Row 宰也街 A testament to its age, Doyers Street is one of the only streets in the city that curves. It was also the site of numerous gang fights Today it is far quieter, although some tunnels built by gangs for escape still remain.

The Chinese population continued to increase



railroad.

The annual immigration guotas were revoked, the Chinese population continued to increase

A Cantonese merchant-and 35 crew members set off

towards New York to look for business opportunities.

They opened shops along Mott, Pell, and Doyers

Chinese immigrants began to arrive in higher numbers.

many settled in the area to take advantage of the

businesses already established and to join family

Streets-now known as the Chinatown Core.

associations for protection and community.







#### CHINATOWN LANDMARKS GGAPP

- Museum of Chinese in America, 1980 215 Centre Street 美國華人博物館, 215號中央街
- 2.\* Bowery Savings Bank, 1895 130 Bowery 包厘街儲備銀行, 130號包厘街
- 3. Mahayana Temple, 1997 133 Canal Street 大乘寺, 133號堅尼街
- Citizens Savings Bank (HSBC Bank), 1924 58 Bowery 公民存款銀行 (匯豐銀行), 58號包厘街
- American Legion LI. Kimlau Chinese Memorial Post 1291, 1961 191 Canal Street 紐約華裔美國退伍軍人會1291, 191號堅尼街
- 6. Columbus Park, 1897 67 Mulberry Street 哥倫布公園, 67號茂比利街
- 7. Five Points & Canal Street 五點地區&堅尼街
- 8.<sup>\*</sup> Church of the Transfiguration, 1966 29 Mott Street 紐約華埠顯聖容天主堂, 29號勿街
- 9. Doyers Street 室也街
- 10. Edward Mooney House, 1785 18 Bowery 穆尼閣, 18號包厘街
- 11. Confucius Plaza, 1975 1-9 Bowery 孔子大廈, 1-9號包厘街
- 12. Kimlau Square, 1961 Park Row 華裔軍人忠烈坊
- First Shearith Israel Graveyard / Chatham Square Cemetery, 1682 55-57 St. James Place 且林士果廣場墓地, 55-57號聖詹士坊
- First Chinese Presbyterian Church, 1819 61 Henry Street
   中華基督教長老會, 61號亨利街
- 15. Loew's Canal Street Theatre, 1927 31 Canal Street 堅尼街31號劇院
- 16. Eldridge Street Synagogue, 1887 12 Eldridge Street 華埠愛烈治街猶太教堂, 12號愛烈治街

\* Landmarks Preservation Commission (LPC) Landmark



#### Public Space Utilization



#### <u>Why</u>

- Create a communal space for vendors and merchants
- Identify locations for cultural activities
- Attract young visitorship



How

- AAFE, CCBA, or CREATE in Chinatown to encourage and organize cultural
  - activities and events

# Public Space Utilization




# Street Vending Expansion



How

### <u>Why</u>

- Permit demand is greater than supply
- Recognizable feature of the Chinatown streetscape
- Vital part of the local economy

- Issue more permits every year
- Use the business models of Hester Street Fair, Taipei's night market, and Union Square market



# Sanitation Improvement



### Why

- Illegal trash dumping is pervasive
- Trash piles and trash overflow mar the streetscape
- Organic waste provides food source for vermin

- Increase government enforcement
- Use rat-proof trash bins •
- Synchronize commercial dumping and pick-up schedule with apps or text alerts













### <u>Why</u>

- Encourage both older and younger generations to explore their neighborhood
- Enhance visitor experience
- Help keep Chinatown relevant to an increasingly tech-focused society



#### How

- Prototype designed by studio
- Sponsorship by a local organization



#### Manhattan Chinatown ---

•



Chinatown is the oldest continuous ethnic enclave in North America. Over the past several certuries it has been home to several ethnic groups including Jewish, German, Irish, Italian, Puerto Rican, and obviously Chinese. Today the neighborhood is distinguished by its distinctive signage. Remnants of past enclaves still exist if you know where to look.

#### **START TOUR**

Take a walk with us and experience Chinatown's unique cultural and historic heritage.



How

# Sidewalk Redesign

### Why

- Obstructed pedestrian paths
- Crosswalks are too long
- Pedestrian injuries and fatalities
  - Vehicles speeding
  - Vehicles do not yield to pedestrians

### Delineated sidewalk zones

- Retail/ vending/ pedestrian uses
- Modify signal timing
- Sidewalk bulb-outs

# Sidewalk Redesign





# Local Business Stabilization

### <u>Why</u>

- Challenges for small business
  owners
  - Increased commercial rents
  - Outdated retailers and restaurants
  - Loss of customers
    - Growth of other Chinatowns
    - Increased non-Chinese population
    - Displaced local residents
    - Closing of Park Row
    - No parking for tour buses

### <u>How</u>

- To attract customers
  - o Preserve historic architecture
  - Preserve unique ethnic businesses
  - Modernize and broaden product offerings
- To retain local residents
  - Explore sector-based workforce programs
- To retain business
  - Vending on Canal Street
  - Redevelop second floor spaces



# Chinatown Special Purpose District



To preserve and support Chinatown's uniqueness:

•

- Historical significance
- Cultural importance
- Resources for residents & visitors

- Define boundary by the existing linguistic landscape and demographics.
- Rezoning to:
  - Provide affordable housing for current residents
  - Support local economy by limiting big-box commercial tenants
  - **Legalize existing signage**

# Specific Objectives

#### • Affordable Housing

- Apply Mandatory Inclusionary Housing, using a newly created local AMI
- Restrictions applicable to development:
  - Limit development within the Historic Core subdistrict
  - For each new development outside of the Historic Core subdistrict,
    - Create a mechanism to fund the preservation of affordable housing within the historic core
    - Require a non-eviction certificate
    - Allow senior NYCHA residents priority move-in
    - Incentivize seniors to move into new units by working with local organizations to provide niche services
- Allow the transfer of development rights within the Historic Core subdistrict to identified receiving sites
  - Use the transfer fee to improve open spaces, tenant protections, education, and legal counseling

Specific Objectives

#### • Support Local Businesses

- Require a special permit for hotel use within the whole district
- Limit big box or chain stores to 10,000 square feet
- Set aside a percentage of commercial floor area in new development for unique local businesses
- Legalize the signage to modify size, illumination, and quantity restrictions



# Acknowledgements 感謝

Gale Brewer, Manhattan Borough President

Margaret Chin, Council Member for District 1

**Roxanne Earley**, Director of Land Use and Planning, District 1, Councilmember Chin's Staff

**Basha Gerhards**, Deputy Director of Land Use, Planning, and Development, Office of MBP

**Erica Baptiste**, Urban Planner for Community Boards 2, 3, and 8, Office of MBP

Wellington Chen, Chinatown Partnership & Chinatown BID

Gigi Li, Former Chair of Community Board 3 and CWG

**Joel Kolkmann**, Team Leader & Senior Planner for NYC DCP

**Thomas Yu**, Strategic Development Officer at AAFE, former chair of CWG

Jerry Shiao, President of CCBA

Ethel Sheffer, Studio Instructor Douglas Woodward, Studio Instructor Dorothy MacAusland, Teaching Assistant GSAPP Faculty

# Thank You 謝謝



#### Data Sources

- US Census Bureau. 2015 American Community Survey 5-year Estimates "Physical Housing Characteristics for Occupied Housing Units" [dataset]. 2016.
  -----. 2015 American Community Survey 5-year Estimates "Median Income in the Past 12 Months (In 2012 Inflation-Adjusted Dollars)" [dataset]. 2016.
- ---, 2015 American Community Survey 5-year Estimates "Median Gross Rent (Dollars)" [dataset]. 2016.
- -----. 2010 American Community Survey 5-year Estimates "Median Income in the Past 12 Months (In 2012 Inflation-Adjusted Dollars)" [dataset].2011.
- -----. 2010 American Community Survey 5-year Estimates "Median Gross Rent (Dollars)" [dataset]. 2011.
  - NYU Furman Center. Subsidized Housing Dataset. 15 Nov 2016. Retrieved from
    <hr/>
    <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
     <hr/>
  - NYC Department of City Planning. Inclusionary Housing Designated Areas. 29 Jan 2013, Updated 20 Jan 2017. Retrieved from <a href="https://data.cityofnewyork.us/City-Government/Inclusionary-Housing-Designated-Areas/w83z-2kf9">https://data.cityofnewyork.us/City-Government/Inclusionary-Housing-Designated-Areas/w83z-2kf9</a>
  - City of New York Mayor's Office. Housing New York A Five-Borough, Ten-Year Plan. 2014
    Center of Neighborhood Technology. 2013 American Community Survey 5-year Estimates "Housing Characteristics, Transportation Used, Community Demographics, Income, Employment" [dataset]. 2014.

#### References

- CWG Report: Pratt Center for Community Development, The Collective for Community, Culture, and the Environment, 2014.
- Christopher D. Brazee, "East Village / Lower East Side Historic District: Designation Report," NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission, October 2012, accessed February 10, 2017, http://s-media.nyc.gov/agencies/lpc/lp/2491.pdf
- Wendy Wan-Yin Tan, "Chinatowns of New York City," Arcadia Publishing, 2008, accessed February 10, 2017, print, ix.
- Waverly B. Lowell, "Chinese Immigration and the the Chinese in the United States," National Archives and Record Administration, 1996, accessed February 10, 2017, https://www.archives.gov/research/chinese-americans/guide.html.
- Kevin Baker, "The First Slum in America," The New York Times, 2001, accessed February 10, 2017, http://www.nytimes.com/2001/09/30/books/the-first-slum-in-america.html.
- Jeremy Nemeth and Justin Hollander, "Security Zones and New York City's Shrinking Public Space," 2010, http://contemporaryurbananthropology.org/pdfs/Nemeth%20and%20Hollander,%20Security%20Zones%20in%20New%20York.pdf.
- Bucky Turco, "Here's What It's Like to Live Behind an NYPD Checkpoint in Chinatown," 2015, http://animalnewyork.com/2015/heres-what-its-like-to-live-behind-an-nypd-checkpoint-in-chinatown/.
- Rebuild Chinatown Initiative: The Community Speaks (AAFE), 2002
- AAF, Revitalizing Chinatown Businesses, 2008.
- Chinatown Then and Now: Gentrification in Boston, New York, and Philadelphia (AALDEF), 2013.
- New York City Department of City Planning, "CHINATOWN Street Revitalization", 1976.
- Rebuild Chinatown Initiative," The Community Speaks One Year After September 11, 2001", Asian Americans for Equality, 2002.
- "Chinatown BID What Is a BID?" Accessed March 2, 2017. http://www.supportchinatownbid.org/Chinatown%20BID%20-%20What%20is%20a%20BID.htm.
- "CWG\_Participants." Accessed March 2, 2017. http://www.chinatownworkinggroup.org/Participants.htm.
- Google Maps
- "Welcome to Chinatown!" 2017. Accessed March 2. http://www.chinatownpartnership.org/index.htm.